arXiv:1411.5756v1 [math.CO] 21 Nov 2014

ON THE COVARIANCES OF OUTDEGREES IN RANDOM PLANE RECURSIVE TREES

HÜSEYIN ACAN AND PAWEŁ HITCZENKO‡

In 2005 Janson [3], extending earlier work of Mahmoud, Smythe, and Szymański [4], established the joint asymptotic normality of the outdegrees of a random plane recursive tree (we refer to [3] for references, discussion and statements, and to [2] for a much wider context). In particular, he gave the following formula for the entries of the limiting covariance matrix [3, Theorem 1.3]:

$$\tilde{\sigma}_{ij} = 2\sum_{k=0}^{i}\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^{k+l}}{k+l+4}\binom{i}{k}\binom{j}{l}\left(\frac{2(k+l+4)!}{(k+3)!(l+3)!} - 1 - \frac{(k+1)(l+1)}{(k+3)(l+3)}\right). \tag{1}$$

Since this formula is not very convenient to work with (in particular the behavior of $\tilde{\sigma}_{ij}$ as i and/or j grow to infinity is not immediately clear), we found it worthwhile to point out that it may be considerably simplified. Throughout, $(x)_m = x(x-1)\dots(x-(m-1))$ denotes the falling factorial.

Proposition 1. *For all integers $i \geq 0$, $j \geq 0$ we have*

$$\tilde{\sigma}_{ij} = \frac{16}{(i+3)_3(j+3)_3} - \frac{24}{(i+j+4)_4}, \text{ if } i \neq j;$$
$$\tilde{\sigma}_{jj} = \frac{4}{(j+3)_3} + \frac{16}{(j+3)_3^2} - \frac{24}{(2j+4)_4}.$$

For the proof we will need two identities involving binomial coefficients that we present in the following two lemmas.

Lemma 2. *For all integers $k \geq 0$, $a \geq 0$, and $j \geq k$:*

$$\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\binom{j}{l}\binom{k+l+a}{l+a} = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } j > k; \\ (-1)^j; & \text{if } j = k. \end{cases}$$

Proof. This is a special case of formula (5.24) in [1] as we have found thanks to the encouragement by one of the referees to search for a source in the literature. It corresponds to $m = 0$ and $s = n+a$ in the notation used in [1]. However, to keep this letter self–contained we supply a short proof. We proceed by induction over k for all a and $j \geq k$. If $k = 0$ the equality holds for all $a \geq 0$ since its left–hand side is $(1-1)^j$ if $j > 0$ and 1 if $j = 0$. Assume it holds for non-negative integers up to k and all values of a and $j \geq k$. Let $a \geq 0$ be any integer. For $j \geq k+1$

$$\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\binom{j}{l}\binom{k+1+l+a}{l+a} = \frac{k+1+a}{k+1}\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\binom{j}{l}\binom{k+l+a}{l+a}$$
$$+\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\frac{j!}{l!(j-l)!}\frac{l(k+l+a)!}{(k+1)!(l+a)!}.$$

Key words and phrases. asymptotic normality, covariance matrix, binomial identities.

‡ The second author was partially supported by a Simons Foundation grant #208766. His work was carried out during a visit at Monash University in the first half of 2014. He would like to thank the members of the School of Mathematical Sciences and Nick Wormald in particular for hospitality and support.

The first sum is zero by the inductive hypothesis. We cancel the l's in the second sum and write it as

$$\sum_{l=1}^{j}(-1)^l\frac{j!}{(l-1)!(j-l)!}\frac{(k+l-1+a+1)!}{(k+1)k!(l-1+a+1)!}=-\frac{j}{k+1}\sum_{l=0}^{j-1}(-1)^l\binom{j-1}{l}\binom{k+l+a+1}{l+a+1}.$$

By the inductive hypothesis (applied to k, $a+1$, and $j-1$) this sum is zero if $j-1>k$ and is $(-1)^{j-1}$ if $j-1=k$. This proves that the original expression is zero if $j>k+1$ and is $(-1)^j$ if $j=k+1$ thus completing the induction. □

Lemma 3. *For all integers $j\geq 0$, $i\geq 0$, and $a\geq 1$ we have*

$$\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^l}{(l+a)\binom{l+a+i}{i}}\binom{j}{l}=\frac{1}{a\binom{i+j+a}{a}}=\frac{(a-1)!}{(i+j+a)_a}.$$

Proof. We use induction over $j\geq 0$ for all $a\geq 1$ and $i\geq 0$. (Alternatively i can stay fixed throughout). When $j=0$ both sides are $1/(a\binom{a+i}{i})$. Assume the statement holds for all integers up to j and all $a\geq 1$. We will prove that it holds for $j+1$ and all integers $a\geq 1$. We have

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{l=0}^{j+1}\frac{(-1)^l}{(l+a)\binom{l+a+i}{i}}\binom{j+1}{l}&=\sum_{l=0}^{j+1}\frac{(-1)^l}{(l+a)\binom{l+a+i}{i}}\left\{\binom{j}{l}+\binom{j}{l-1}\right\}\\
&=\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^l}{(l+a)\binom{l+a+i}{i}}\binom{j}{l}+\sum_{l=1}^{j+1}\frac{(-1)^l}{(l+a)\binom{l+a+i}{i}}\binom{j}{l-1}\\
&=\frac{1}{a\binom{i+j+a}{a}}+\sum_{l=1}^{j+1}\frac{(-1)^{l-1+1}}{(l-1+a+1)\binom{l-1+a+1+i}{i}}\binom{j}{l-1}\\
&=\frac{1}{a\binom{i+j+a}{a}}-\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^l}{(l+a+1)\binom{l+a+1+i}{i}}\binom{j}{l}=\frac{1}{a\binom{i+j+a}{a}}-\frac{1}{(a+1)\binom{i+j+a+1}{a+1}}\\
&=\frac{(a-1)!(i+j)!}{(i+j+a)!}\left\{1-\frac{a}{i+j+a+1}\right\}=\frac{(a-1)!(i+j+1)!}{(i+j+a+1)!}=\frac{1}{a\binom{i+j+1+a}{a}},
\end{aligned}$$

where we have used the inductive hypothesis, first with j and a and then with j and $a+1$. This proves Lemma 3. □

Proof of Proposition 1. Assume without loss of generality that $0\leq i\leq j$. We split the right–hand side of (1) as

$$4\sum_{k=0}^{i}\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^{k+l}}{k+l+4}\binom{i}{k}\binom{j}{l}\frac{(k+l+4)!}{(k+3)!(l+3)!} \tag{2}$$

$$-2\sum_{k=0}^{i}\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^{k+l}}{k+l+4}\binom{i}{k}\binom{j}{l}\left(1+\frac{(k+1)(l+1)}{(k+3)(l+3)}\right). \tag{3}$$

We claim that (2) is zero unless $i=j$ in which case it is $4/(j+3)_3$. To see this note that

$$\frac{(k+l+4)!}{(k+l+4)(k+3)!(l+3)!}=\frac{1}{(k+3)_3}\binom{k+l+3}{l+3},$$

so that

$$\sum_{k=0}^{i}\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^{k+l}}{k+l+4}\binom{i}{k}\binom{j}{l}\frac{(k+l+4)!}{(k+3)!(l+3)!}$$
$$=\sum_{k=0}^{i}\frac{(-1)^k}{(k+3)_3}\binom{i}{k}\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\binom{j}{l}\binom{k+l+3}{l+3}.$$

Since $k\le i$ and we assumed that $i\le j$, by Lemma 2, the inner sum is zero unless $i=j$ and if that is the case only the term $k=i=j$ in the outer sum is non–zero and it is

$$\frac{(-1)^j}{(j+3)_3}\binom{j}{j}\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\binom{j}{l}\binom{j+l+3}{l+3}=\frac{(-1)^{2j}}{(j+3)_3}=\frac{1}{(j+3)_3},$$

by Lemma 2. To handle (3) we write

$$1+\frac{(k+1)(l+1)}{(k+3)(l+3)}=2\frac{(k+1)(l+1)+(k+l+4)}{(k+3)(l+3)},$$

so that (3) is

$$-4\sum_{k=0}^{i}(-1)^k\frac{k+1}{k+3}\binom{i}{k}\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\frac{l+1}{(l+3)(k+l+4)}\binom{j}{l} \tag{4}$$

$$-4\sum_{k=0}^{i}(-1)^k\frac{1}{k+3}\binom{i}{k}\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\frac{1}{l+3}\binom{j}{l}. \tag{5}$$

By Lemma 3 (used with $a=3$ and $i=0$) (5) is

$$-4\frac{2}{(i+3)_3}\frac{2}{(j+3)_3}=-\frac{16}{(i+3)_3(j+3)_3}.$$

To handle (4) we first note that

$$\sum_{l=0}^{j}(-1)^l\frac{l+1}{(l+3)(k+l+4)}\binom{j}{l}=\frac{k+3}{(k+1)(k+4)\binom{k+j+4}{j}}-\frac{2}{3(k+1)\binom{j+3}{j}}.$$

This follows from partial fraction decomposition

$$\frac{l+1}{(l+3)(k+l+4)}=\frac{k+3}{k+1}\cdot\frac{1}{k+l+4}-\frac{2}{(k+1)(l+3)}$$

and

$$\sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^l}{k+l+4}\binom{j}{l}=\frac{1}{(k+4)\binom{k+j+4}{j}},\quad \sum_{l=0}^{j}\frac{(-1)^l}{l+3}\binom{j}{l}=\frac{1}{3\binom{j+3}{j}},$$

which is Lemma 3 used twice, with $a=k+4$ and $i=0$ for the first equality, and with $a=3$ and $i=0$ for the second equality. Therefore, (4) is

$$-4\sum_{k=0}^{i}(-1)^k\frac{1}{(k+4)\binom{k+j+4}{j}}\binom{i}{k}+\frac{16}{(j+3)_3}\sum_{k=0}^{i}(-1)^k\frac{1}{k+3}\binom{i}{k}.$$

Applying Lemma 3 (with $a=4$ and general i) to the first term and with $a=3$ and $i=0$ to the second term we find that (4) is

$$-\frac{24}{(i+j+4)_4}+\frac{32}{(i+3)_3(j+3)_3}.$$

Hence, the combined contribution of (4) and (5) is

$$-\frac{16}{(i+3)_3(j+3)_3}+\frac{32}{(i+3)_3(j+3)_3}-\frac{24}{(i+j+4)_4}=\frac{16}{(i+3)_3(j+3)_3}-\frac{24}{(i+j+4)_4},$$

which completes the proof.

References

[1] R. L. Graham, D. E. Knuth, O. Patashnik. *Concrete Mathematics* 2nd ed. Addison–Wesley, Boston 1994.
[2] S. Janson. Functional limit theorems for multitype branching processes and generalized Pólya urns. *Stochastic Processes, Appl.* **110** (2004), 177–245.
[3] S. Janson. Asymptotic degree distribution in random recursive trees. *Random Structures Algorithms*, **26** (2005), 69–83.
[4] H. M. Mahmoud, R. T. Smythe, J. Szymański. On the structure of random plane oriented recursive trees and their branches. *Random Structures Algorithms* **4** (1993), 151–176.

School of Mathematical Sciences, Monash University, Melbourne, VIC 3800, Australia

E-mail address: huseyin.acan@monash.edu.au

Department of Mathematics, Drexel University, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA

E-mail address: phitczenko@math.drexel.edu